## Peertechz



HIV for Clinical and Scientific Research

ISSN: 2455-3786

55-3786 DO

#### **Review Article**

# Prevalence of Cryptosporidium species among HIV/AIDS patients in Sub Saharan Africa; Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

## Ephrem Awulachew<sup>1\*</sup>, Kuma Diriba<sup>2</sup>, Aschalew Gemede<sup>2</sup> and Feven Wudneh<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Division of Dental Hygiene, University of Minnesota, 515 Delaware Street SE, 9-372 Moos Tower, Minneapolis, MN, 55455, USA

<sup>2</sup>Department of Medical Laboratory Sciences, Health Science and Medical College, PO Box 419, Dilla University, Dilla, Ethiopia

Received: 22 February , 2020 Accepted: 02 May, 2020 Published: 04 May, 2020

\*Corresponding author: Ephrem Awulachew, Division of Dental Hygiene, University of Minnesota, 515 Delaware Street SE, 9-372 Moos Tower, Minneapolis, MN, 55455, USA, Tell: +25149181161; E-mail: efrive@gmail.com

**Keywords:** AIDS; Cryptosporidium parvum; Human immunodeficiency virus; Intestinal coccidian; Opportunistic; Prevalence; Sub saharan africa

https://www.peertechz.com



## Abstract

**Background:** Cryptosporidium species is increasingly recognized as a leading cause of diarrheal disease with life threatening condition in HIV/AIDS patients. Cryptosporidium species is one of the AIDS defining illnesses and associated with an increased risk of death compared to other AIDS-defining illnesses.

Objective: To systematically review prevalence of Cryptosporidium species among HIV/AIDS patients in Sub Saharan Africa.

**Methods**: A comprehensive search of electronic databases was conducted on PubMed, EMBASE, African Journal Online (AJOL) and advanced Google Scholar. The reference lists of all identified articles were searched for additional studies. Meta-analyses were carried out using review manager 5.3, comprehensive meta-analysis and R software version 3.6.1. Evidence for statistical heterogeneity of results was assessed using Cochrane Q <sup>x2</sup> test and I<sup>2</sup> statistic.

**Results**: A total of 21 studies were included in the systematic review. Meta-analysis by random effect model showed that the estimated pooled prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection in people with HIV infection was 11 % (678/6,262; 95% CI: 7–16%). We demonstrated that CD4 level was significantly related to *Cryptosporidium* infection, where the highest risk patients are those with CD4 level < 200 cells/µl (OR: 6.039, 95% CI: 4.441- 8.212, P< 0.0001). The funnel plot demonstrated that there was no publication bias.

Conclusion: The results of our meta-analysis show a heavy burden of Cryptosporidium infection among HIV/AIDS patients in sub Saharan Africa (11%).

## Abbreviation

AIDS: Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome; ART: Anti-Retroviral Therapy; CoCoPop: Condition, Context, Population; HAART: Highly Active Anti-retroviral Therapy; HIV: Human Immune Virus; JBI-MAStARI: Joanna Briggs Institute Meta-Analysis of Statistics Assessment for Review Instrument; WHO: World Health Organization

## Background

*Cryptosporidium* species are intestinal protozoan parasites of the phylum Apicomplexa, which cause diarrheal disease in humans worldwide. Although *Cryptosporidium* was discovered in 1907, the first human cases of cryptosporidiosis were reported in 1976. But after the emergence of the HIV/AIDS in the early 1980s, the parasite has become widely recognized as a human pathogen [1,2].

006

*Cryptosporidium* is primarily transmitted mainly through feco-oral route either by direct contact with an infected human or animal or indirectly via contaminated food or water [3]. The infectious dose of *Cryptosporidium* species is as low as 9–10 oocysts [4,5]. Oocysts of *Cryptosporidium* remain infectious in the environment for at least 6 months if kept moist and resistant to conventional water treatment such as chlorination [6,7].

*Cryptosporidium* species infection is common in many developing countries of sub-Saharan Africa due to poor sanitation, poor hygiene and unavailability of safe drinking water [8,9]. It was previously considered non-pathogenic or with transient pathogenic potential in immune-competent individuals, but nowadays becoming aggressive and cause debilitating illness in HIV/AIDS patients [10].

In patients with HIV/AIDS, prevalence of cryptosporidiosis vary widely, ranging from 0 to 100% with the higher rates reported in patients that have not started ART [11]. According to global disease burden report published in 2010, a prevalence rate of 2.6–21.3% has been documented in Africa. *Cryptosporidiosis* is one of the AIDS-defining illnesses and associated with an increased risk of death compared to other AIDS-defining illnesses [12]. The advent of highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) has reduced the prevalence of this disease in AIDS patients [13–15]. The emergence of drug-resistant HIV strain and failure of HAART has been associated with re-emergence of *Cryptosporidium* species infection in HIV/AIDS patients [15].

In 2013, globally an estimated 35.0 million people were living with HIV/AIDS. Sub-Saharan Africa accounts for 71% of the global burden of HIV infection [16]. AIDS-related death declined by about 42% from 2010 to 2017 in eastern and southern Africa, reflecting that the rapid growth of treatment scale-up in the region [17]. About 80% of AIDS patients died from AIDS-related disease including intestinal parasites rather than HIV infection itself. *Cryptosporidium* species on the other hand is an emerging cause of chronic diarrhea with lifethreatening conditions in HIV/AIDS patients ]18].

Diarrhea occurs in about 90% HIV/AIDS patients in developing countries, including sub-Saharan Africa [19]. *Cryptosporidium* species is increasingly recognized as a leading cause of diarrheal disease, and its largest burden occurs in HIV/AIDS patients [20]. HIV/AIDS patients with CD4 count falls below 100 cells/ mm<sup>3</sup> the risk increases for severe disease accompanied by malabsorption, weight loss, and high case fatality [21].

In 2004, cryptosporidiosis was added to the WHO's 'Neglected Diseases Initiative' which includes diseases that occur mainly in developing countries [22]. Cryptosporidium co-infections and associated morbidities are common among people living with HIV/AIDS and have implications for their treatment and care. So, it is found mandatory to know the magnitude of the neglected *Cryptosporidium* infection among HIV/AIDS patients so as to develop strategies to prevent and control the disease. The main objective of this review was to summarize data on the prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species infection among HIV/AIDS patients in sub-Saharan Africa.

## **Methods**

#### Search strategy

In this review all studies published in the English language from 1990 to October 2019 were searched. The search strategy was conducted in three steps; initially, the search was conducted on PubMed followed by the analysis of text words contained in the title and abstract, and index terms used to describe the article. Secondly using all identified keywords, and mesh terms where each factor was combined using the "OR" operator and "AND" operator was used to search studies across PubMed, Embase, African Journal Online (AJOL) and Google scholar. Database search terms included were those that used to describe Cryptosporidium species and Human Immuno Virus (HIV) infection as well as terms that describe the context of this study. The search terms were: coccidian parasite, Cryptosporidiosis, Cryptosporidium parvum, opportunistic parasite, prevalence, and human immunodeficiency virus, HIV, AIDS, HIV/AIDS, Africa, and Sub Saharan Africa). Full-text articles were retrieved after review of the title and abstract. Thirdly, the reference lists of all identified studies were searched for additional studies that are relevant to this study. An Endnote software version 5 was used to manage references in this review

## Inclusion and exclusion of studies

**Inclusion criteria:** To review the prevalence of *Cryptosporidium species* infections in HIV/AIDS patients, we considered the following criteria: i) Studies on the prevalence of Cryptosporidium among HIV /AIDS patients were included in the study. ii) Only a study conducted in sub-Sahara African countries were considered. iii) Studies published in English were selected. iv) No restriction on methods of diagnosis.

**Exclusion criteria**: Observational studies including case reports and case series were excluded.

#### Assessment of study quality

Studies selected for inclusion were assessed for methodological quality by two independent reviewers using standard critical appraisal instruments for prevalence study Condition, context and population (CoCoPop) from the Joanna Briggs Institute Meta-Analysis of Statistics Assessment for Review Instrument (JBI-MAStARI). A 10-point scoring system was used to rate the quality of the articles retrieved. Scoring was conducted by two independent investigators using a modification of the Downs and Black checklist [23]. For inclusion in the review, both reviewers (E.A and K.D) agreed that a cut-off a score of five out of 10 was used to determine acceptable quality for inclusion. Disagreements were resolved by consensus.

The study quality assessments criteria were: objective of the study clearly described, study design clearly stated, the sample size representativeness of the population from which they were recruited, method of identification of the parasite identification clearly identified, outcome assessed with the objective criteria, were confounders reported, were potential

Citation: Awulachew E, Diriba K, Gemede A, Wudneh F (2020) Prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species among HIV/AIDS patients in Sub Saharan Africa; Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. J HIV Clin Sci Res 7(1): 006-012. DOI: https://dx.doi.org/10.17352/2455-3786.000130

007

biases reported, was outcome clearly described, appropriate statistical analysis method used, and if whether the context of the study is sub-Saharan Africa (Table 1).

#### **Data extraction**

The two authors (E.A and K.D) extracted the data from included studies using a standardized form independently and checked the data together. A critical appraisal checklist for observational studies (prevalence study) adopted from JBI was used to assess the overall methodological quality of the included studies [24]. From each included studies, detail description of study subjects, report on the study area, year of publication, study design, sample size, method of *Cryptosporidium* species screening was extracted. Secondary outcomes for this study included clinical data including the presence or absence of diarrhea, whether the patient started ART treatment or not, a CD4 count of the patients, and distribution of Cryptosporidium species by age, sex of the patients (Table 2).

#### Data analysis and data synthesis

Meta-analyses were carried out using review manager 5.3, comprehensive meta-analysis and R software version 3.6.1 with user contributed commands for meta-analyses: metan, metainf, metabias, and metareg [25]. The effect sizes and SEs of the studies were pooled using a random-effects model to calculate the pooled prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species

among HIV/AIDS patients. The association of prevalence of cryptosporidium species with CD4 count and with the presence and absence of diarrhea will be evaluated and odds ratio was used to present association.

#### Risk of bias and sensitivity analysis

The random-effects meta-analysis models were chosen because heterogeneity was demonstrated [26]. Evidence for statistical heterogeneity of results was assessed using Cochrane Q x<sup>2</sup> test and I<sup>2</sup> statistic. A significance level of P<0.10 and I<sup>2</sup> >50% was interpreted as evidence of heterogeneity [27]. A potential source of heterogeneity was investigated by subgroup analysis and meta-regression analysis [28]. Where statistical pooling was not possible the findings were presented in a narrative form including tables and figures to aid in data presentation where appropriate.

Sensitivity analyses were conducted to weigh up the relative influence of each individual study on the pooled effect size using user-written function, metainf [25]. The presence of publication bias was assessed informally by visual inspections of funnel plots [29].

#### Results

#### Study selection

As shown in the flowchart above (Figure 1) the literature

Table 1: Methodological quality of included studies.											
	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5	Q6	Q7	Q8	Q9	Q10	Total points 100%
G. Hunter	6	5	7	7	6	5	5	7	7	10	65
Fisseha B	6	7	8	7	6	8	7	7	6	10	72
MarianneLebbad	9	8	7	8	9	6	9	8	7	9	79
Maiga MY	5	8	7	7	9	8	5	8	9	9	71
Adjei A	7	5	6	6	7	7	7	5	5	7	62
ERIC R. HOUPT	6	7	8	7	6	8	7	7	6	10	71
Frederick O. A	9	8	7	8	9	6	9	8	7	9	79
Ce´ line Nguefeu	5	8	7	7	9	8	5	8	9	9	75
Dibua	7	5	6	6	7	7	7	5	5	7	62
Leopold G. Lehman	6	5	7	7	6	5	5	7	7	10	65
Zelalem Teklemariam	6	7	8	7	6	8	7	7	6	10	72
Haileeyesus Adamu	6	5	7	7	6	5	5	7	7	10	65
Mekonnen Girma	6	7	8	7	6	8	7	7	6	10	72
Jane W. Wanyiri	9	8	8	7	9	6	9	8	7	9	79
Sekesai Mtapuri-Zinyowera1	5	8	7	7	9	8	5	8	9	9	75
Marius Zambou Vouking	7	5	6	6	7	7	7	5	5	7	62
Habtom Kiros	6	7	8	7	6	8	7	7	6	10	72
Dickson Shey Nsagha	9	7	8	8	9	6	9	8	7	9	79
Dereje Gedle	5	8	7	7	9	8	5	8	9	9	75
Veronica Casmo	7	5	6	6	7	7	7	5	5	7	62
Juliet Nakibirango	6	7	5	7	6	5	5	7	7	10	65

#### Notes: Quality appraisal questions

Q1: Were objective of the study clearly described? Q2: Were study design clearly stated? Q3. Was sample size representativeness of the population from which they were recruited? Q4: Were methods of identification of the parasite identification clearly identified? Q5: Were outcome assessed with the objective criteria?; Q6: Were confounders reported?; Q7: Were potential biases reported?; Q8: Was outcome clearly described?; Q9: Were appropriate statistical analysis method used?; Q10. Were the context of the study being sub Saharan Africa

Citation: Awulachew E, Diriba K, Gemede A, Wudneh F (2020) Prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species among HIV/AIDS patients in Sub Saharan Africa; Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. J HIV Clin Sci Res 7(1): 006-012. DOI: https://dx.doi.org/10.17352/2455-3786.000130

008

#### Table 2: Data extraction form used in this systematic review and meta-analysis.

Data extraction form field	Information to consider in data extraction
Reviewer identification	Review author ID; date
Study identification	Study ID; report ID; citation; author contact details; publication yr; country; source of data
Methods	Study design; setting
Study setting	Saharan Africa country (country of the study)
Participant characteristics	Total number of participant, age, sex; HIV sero-status
Disease characteristics	Naïve HIV (not on HARRT) and ART patients (on HAART), CD4 level, diarrhea
Diagnostic test characteristics	Methods of stool examination: Wet mount microscopic examination, stool concentration techniques, modified AFB staining. ELISA, PCR
Outcome	Outcome definition (unit of measurement: prevalence in number of events (n/N) or in percent (%))
Results to include in a meta- analysis	Dichotomous outcomes: no. of events/no. of participant
Risk of bias	Cochrane RoB tool for prevalence study COCOPOP

search resulted in 37 studies. Eight duplicates were removed. After a review of titles and abstracts of 29 studies, 6 studies were excluded from the systematic review as they no longer met the inclusion criteria. From these four papers were unavailable for full text. One study excluded after full-text screen due to unclear study site and unclear study population and another one study excluded after quality appraisal. After the end of quality appraisal, 21 studies met the inclusion criteria and were retrieved for full text. A total of 21 studies were included in this systematic review and meta-analysis, and the extracted data are summarized in (Table 1). In the included studies a total of 6, 262 HIV-infected patients were assessed for *Cryptosporidium* species infection and the total events of *Cryptosporidium* infections were 678. These studies were done in 10 different countries. All papers were written in English.

#### Study characteristics

Of the 21 studies included in the Meta-analysis, one was a prospective study [30], one retrospective study [15], Two was case-control studies [31,32], and 17 were cross sectional studies [33-50]. Most of the studies conducted a parasitological investigation by microscopic examination of wet mount preparation and concentration techniques while 4 studies employed molecular techniques [43]. Characteristics of the included studies have been shown in Table 3.

#### Synthesis of result

The prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection among HIV/AIDS patients in sub–Saharan Africa ranged between 2.17 and 44% (Table 1). A Meta–analysis by random effect model showed that the estimated pooled prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection in people with HIV infection was 11% (678/6,262; 95% CI: 7–16%). Test of heterogeneity showed that it heterogeneous (Quantifying heterogeneity: tau<sup>2</sup> = 0.9755; H= 4.94; I<sup>2</sup>= 95.9%, P< 0.0001) (Figure 2).

#### Additional analysis

This review also extracted additional data on Cryptosporidium

infection from the included study. Due to the variability of data quality and reporting system, we only extracted and analyzed the data on diarrhea, ART, and CD4 count. According to the



#### Figure 1: Flow chart of the search and study inclusion.

Table 3: Included studies of *Cryptosporidium* infection in people with HIV listed in order of year publication.

1G. HunterZambia19929022.20%2Fisseha BEthiopia19982463825.90%3Marianne LebbadGuinea-Bissau200137925%4Maiga MYMali20024347116.30%5Adjei AGhana200321628.60%6ERIC R. HOUPTTANZANIA20051272217%7Frederick O. ANigeria201339642119DibuaNigeria201339642119DibuaNigeria2013306448%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon201337182.20%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia20143783234.30%12Makonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%13Mekonnen GirmaKenya:20141645634%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%17Habtom KirosEthiopia201430913244%	S. No.	Author	Country	Year of publication	Total sample size	no events	Prevalence
2Fisseha BEthiopia19982463825.90%3Marianne LebbadGuinea-Bissau200137925%4Maiga MYMali20024347116.30%5Adjei AGhana200321628.60%6ERIC R. HOUPTTANZANIA20051272217%7Frederick O. ANigeria20102,000804%8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon201337182.20%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia2014378328.50%12Makonnen GirmaEthiopia20141645634%13Mekonnen GirmaKenya:20141645634%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2014399235.80%18Dickson Shey UokingCameroon201630013244%	1	G. Hunter	Zambia	1992	90	2	2.20%
3Marianne LebbadGuinea-Bissau200137925%4Maiga MYMali20024347116.30%5Adjei AGhana200321628.60%6ERIC R. HOUPTTANZANIA20051272217%7Frederick O. ANigeria20102,000804%8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon201337182.20%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia2014378328.50%12Makonnen GirmaEthiopia20141645634%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2014339235.80%	2	Fisseha B	Ethiopia	1998	246	38	25.90%
4Maiga MYMali20024347116.30%5Adjei AGhana200321628.60%6ERIC R. HOUPTTANZANIA20051272217%7Frederick O. ANigeria20102,000804%8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia2014378328.50%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%	3	Marianne Lebbad	Guinea-Bissau	2001	37	9	25%
5Adjei AGhana200321628.60%6ERIC R. HOUPTTANZANIA20051272217%7Frederick O. ANigeria20102,000804%8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20141645634%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%17Habtom KirosEthiopia201530013244%	4	Maiga MY	Mali	2002	434	71	16.30%
6ERIC R. HOUPTTANZANIA20051272217%7Frederick O. ANigeria20102,000804%8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey Xi th th the timopia201630013244%	5	Adjei A	Ghana	2003	21	6	28.60%
7Frederick O. ANigeria20102,0008044%8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20141645634%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%	6	ERIC R. HOUPT	TANZANIA	2005	127	22	17%
8Ce' line NguefeuCameroon201339642119DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe20142071512.60%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey Xi th th the time of t	7	Frederick O. A	Nigeria	2010	2,000	80	4%
9DibuaNigeria20135048%10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe201429517.20%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey VoukingCameroon201630013244%	8	Ce' line Nguefeu	Cameroon	2013	396	42	11
10Leopold G. LehmanCameroon2013201136.46%11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe201429517.20%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey Ken Marius Ken Marian KinaCameroon201630013244%	9	Dibua	Nigeria	2013	50	4	8%
11Zelalem TeklemariamEthiopia201337182.20%12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe201429517.20%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon2015399235.80%17Habtom KirosEthiopia201630013244%	10	Leopold G. Lehman	Cameroon	2013	201	13	6.46%
12Haileeyesus AdamuEthiopia2014378328.50%13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe201429517.20%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey 	11	Zelalem Teklemariam	Ethiopia	2013	371	8	2.20%
13Mekonnen GirmaEthiopia20142689234.30%14Jane W. WanyiriKenya:20141645634%15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe201429517.20%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey VoukingCameroon201630013244%	12	Haileeyesus Adamu	Ethiopia	2014	378	32	8.50%
14     Jane W. Wanyiri     Kenya:     2014     164     56     34%       15     Sekesai Mtapuri- Zinyowera     Zimbabwe     2014     29     5     17.20%       16     Marius Zambou Vouking     Cameroon     2014     207     15     12.60%       17     Habtom Kiros     Ethiopia     2015     399     23     5.80%       18     Dickson Shey     Cameroon     2016     300     132     44%	13	Mekonnen Girma	Ethiopia	2014	268	92	34.30%
15Sekesai Mtapuri- ZinyoweraZimbabwe201429517.20%16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey VoukingCameroon201630013244%	14	Jane W. Wanyiri	Kenya:	2014	164	56	34%
16Marius Zambou VoukingCameroon20142071512.60%17Habtom KirosEthiopia2015399235.80%18Dickson Shey to the total content on total content on the total content on the total content on total content on the total content on total cont	15	Sekesai Mtapuri- Zinyowera	Zimbabwe	2014	29	5	17.20%
17     Habtom Kiros     Ethiopia     2015     399     23     5.80%       18     Dickson Shey     Cameroon     2016     300     132     44%	16	Marius Zambou Vouking	Cameroon	2014	207	15	12.60%
Dickson SheyCameroon201630013244%	17	Habtom Kiros	Ethiopia	2015	399	23	5.80%
Nsagha	18	Dickson Shey Nsagha	Cameroon	2016	300	132	44%
19     Dereje Gedle     Ethiopia     2017     323     19     5.90%	19	Dereje Gedle	Ethiopia	2017	323	19	5.90%
20     Veronica Casmo     Mozambique     2018     83     6     7.20%	20	Veronica Casmo	Mozambique	2018	83	6	7.20%
21 Juliet Nakibirango Uganda 2019 138 3 2.17%	21	Juliet Nakibirango	Uganda	2019	138	3	2.17%

pooled data of five studies in sub-Saharan African countries, we demonstrated that CD4 level was significantly related to *Cryptosporidium* infection, where the highest risk patients are those with CD4 level < 200 cells/ $\mu$ l (OR: 6.039, 95% CI: 4.441-8.212, P< 0.0001) (Figure 3).

#### Heterogeneity and risk of bias

Subgroup analysis of five studies showed the pooled prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection in HIV-infected patients was significantly higher in patients with diarrhea (OR=1.779 95% CI: 1.057-2.994, p= 0.030) and the pooled prevalence of six studies in sub-Saharan Africa showed the highest prevalence *Cryptosporidium* infection in HIV/AIDS patients was significantly higher in Naïve HIV/AIDS Patients (OR= 1.559; 95% CI= 1.100-2.209; P= 0.013).

The funnel plot helped us distinguish between publication bias and other causes of the asymmetry. It showed that small studies were found not only in the areas of statistical significance. We demonstrated no publication bias (t = -1.3505, df = 19, p-value = 0.1927).

#### Discussion

#### Summary of evidence

In sub–Saharan Africa high burden of *Cryptosporidium* infection in this review indicate the importance of routine testing for *Cryptosporidium* species in all HIV–infected people.

To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review on prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species among HIV infected



Figure 2: Prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species among HIV/AIDS patients in sub Saharan Africa



people in sub-Saharan Africa. Our findings demonstrated evidence for a high prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species among HIV-infected patients in sub-Saharan Africa.

In HIV infected patients, a high prevalence has been reported in Cameroon (44%) [35], Ethiopia (34.30%) [45], Kenya (34%) [40], Ghana (28.60%) [51] and Guinea-Bissau (25%) [43] for *Cryptosporidium* infection. In contrast, a low prevalence has been shown in Uganda (2.17%) [41], Zambia (2.20%) [37], and Nigeria (4%) [32].

The prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection varies depending on the presence or absence of diarrhea, level of CD4 count, ART status [46]. On the other hand, the prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection among HIV/AIDS may vary even within a country or among different populations of the country. For example, in Ethiopia, the prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* infection in Butajira was 5.90% [34] while it was 34.03% in Yirgalem Hospital South of Ethiopia [45]. This might be due to the diagnostic method used to detect *Cryptosporidium* species.

In the present study; we demonstrated that diarrhea, ART, CD4 count was significantly related to *Cryptosporidium* infection in HIV/AIDS patients in comparison with their control. HIV/AIDS patients with CD4 level less than 200 cells/µl are three times likely to be infected by *Cryptosporidium* species (RR=2.95; 95% CI: 2.53-3.43) and Naïve HIV patient 1.75 times likely to be infected by *Cryptosporidium* species than ART started patients (RR= 1.75 95% CI: 1.42-2.17). So, policy makers need to plan and give emphasis to allocate resource for improving health care of HIV infected patients with CD4 count <200 cells.

To explain the possible causes of heterogeneity, we conducted meta-regression and subgroup analyses on various sources including country, patients with diarrhea, and found different main causes of heterogeneity for *Cryptosporidium* infection. These may come from publication year (P = 0.0001), selection of participant with or without diarrhea (P= 0.001) and ART status (P < 0.0001). Other potential causes of heterogeneity may include CD4 level, sample size, and detection methods. Due to missing data we did not analyze them.

#### Limitation

However, this systematic review came up with the prevalence of *Cryptosporidium* species among HIV/AIDS patients in sub-Sahara Africa, we acknowledge few limitations of the present meta-analysis, which may affect the results. First of all four relevant studies which were identified through our literature search were excluded due to unavailability for full-text review. Secondly, the majority of the studies were of moderate or low quality, as most of the data was from the conventional microscopic examination techniques; that have lower sensitivity than ELISA and polymerase chain reaction. So, use of different diagnostic tests with varying diagnostic sensitivity is the other limitation of this study.

#### Conclusions

The results of our meta-analysis show a heavy burden of *Cryptosporidium* infection among HIV/AIDS patients in sub-

010

Saharan Africa (11%). Thus, routine screening of *Cryptosporidium* species should be done, particularly for those who have a CD4 count less than 200 cells/ $\mu$ l and early treatment should be administered. Patient with a CD4 count > 350 and those who had started ART have the lowest prevalence.

#### Availability of data and materials

All the datasets generated and analyzed during the review are included in this article.

#### Author's contribution

E. A, K. D, A.G and F. W designed the study, extracted, critically reviewed and analyzed data and wrote the first draft of the manuscript, and approved the manuscript.

#### References

- Dillingham RA, Lima AA, Guerrant RL (2002) Cryptosporidiosis: epidemiology and impact. Microbes Infect 4: 1059- 1066. Link: https://bit.ly/2Yp7qCQ
- Tzipori S, Widmer G (2008) A hundred-year retrospective on cryptosporidiosis. Trends Parasitol 24: 184-189. Link: https://bit.ly/2Sr1HZe
- Haque R, Mondal D, Karim A, Molla IH, Rahim A, et al. (2009) Prospective case-control study of the association between common enteric protozoal parasites and diarrhea in Bangladesh. Clin Infect Dis 48: 1191-1197. Link: https://bit.ly/2YpTf0d
- DuPont HL, Chappell CL, Sterling CR, Okhuysen PC, Rose JB, et al. (1995) The infectivity of Cryptosporidium parvum in healthy volunteers. N Engl J Med 332: 855-859. Link: https://bit.ly/3bXlsj1
- Okhuysen PC, Chappell CL, Crabb JH, Sterling CR, DuPont HL, et al. (1999) Virulence of three distinct Cryptosporidium parvum isolates for healthy adults. J Infect Dis 180: 1275-1281. Link: https://bit.ly/2WgPkQI Y
- oder JS, Harral C, Beach MJ, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) (2010) Cryptosporidiosis surveillance - United States. MMWR Surveill Summ 59: 1-14. Link: https://bit.ly/3d3QJAM
- Havelaar A, Boonyakarnkul T, Cunliffe D (2003) Guidelines for Drinking Water Quality Water Borne Pathogens, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn. Geneva: . World Health Organization.
- Tiwari BR, Ghimire P, Malla S, Sharma B, Karki S (2013) Intestinal parasitic infection among the HIV infected patients in Nepal. J Infect Dev Ctries 7: 550-555. Link: https://bit.ly/3aYHLU0
- Zafar A, Khan MK, Abbas Z, Abbas RZ, Sindhu ZD, et al. (2019) Human Cryptosporidiosis: An insight into Epidemiology, Modern Diagnostic Tools and Recent Drug Discoveries. 6: 60-70. Link: https://bit.ly/2z2B06q
- Alemu F (2014) Prevalence of intestinal parasites and other parasites among HIV/AIDS patients with on ART attending Dilla Referral Hospital, Ethiopia. J AIDS Clin Res 5: 343. Link: https://bit.ly/3bY1V1Y
- Hunter PR, Nichols G (2002) Epidemiology and clinical features of Cryptosporidium infection in immunocompromised patients. Clin Microbiol Rev 15: 145-154. Link: https://bit.ly/2SsTnZb
- Colford JM Jr, Tager IB, Hirozawa AM, Lemp GF, Aragon T, et al. (1966) Cryptosporidiosis among patients infected with human immunodeficiency virus. Factors related to symptomatic infection and survival. Am J Epidemiol 144: 807-816. Link: https://bit.ly/2KTOZOz
- Miao YM, Awad-El-Kariem FM, Franzen C, Ellis DS, Müller A, et al. (2000) Eradication of cryptosporidia and microsporidia following successful antiretroviral therapy. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 25: 124-129. Link: https://bit.ly/35sw5rO

- Carr A, Marriott D, Field A, Vasak E, Cooper DA, et al. (1998) Treatment of HIV-1-associated microsporidiosis and cryptosporidiosis with combination antiretroviral therapy. Lancet 351: 256-261. Link: https://bit.ly/2z00uj8
- Maggi P, Larocca AM, Quarto M, Serio G, Brandonisio O, et al. (2000) Effect of antiretroviral therapy on cryptosporidiosis and microsporidiosis in patients infected with human immunodeficiency virus type 1. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 19: 213-217. Link: https://bit.ly/2WkFFbT
- UNAIDS (2014) Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS). The Gap Report ISBN.
- 17. Nash D, Yotebieng M, Sohn AH (2018) Treating all people living with HIV in sub-Saharan Africa: a new era calling for new approaches. J Virus Erad 4: 1-4. Link: https://bit.ly/2KW2xJy
- Kelly P (1998) Diarrhea and AIDS: recent developments in African setting. Afr Health 20: 16-18. Link: https://bit.ly/2Ss0jFJ
- Shimelis T, Tassachew YTL, Lambiyo T (2016) Cryptosporidium and other intestinal parasitic infections among HIV patients in southern Ethiopia: significance of improved HIV-related care. Parasit Vectors 9: 270. Link: https://bit.ly/3fe76Nm
- 20. Xiao L (2010) Molecular epidemiology of cryptosporidiosis: an update. Exp Parasitol 124: 80-89. Link: https://bit.ly/3ffhhBa
- 21. Cabada MM, White AC (2010) Treatment of cryptosporidiosis: do we know what we think we know? Curr Opin Infect Dis 23: 494-499. Link: https://bit.ly/3b09luC
- 22. Savioli L, Smith H, Thompson A (2006) Giardia and Cryptosporidium join the 'Neglected Diseases Initiative. Trends Parasitol 22: 203-208. Link: https://bit.ly/2z9ssdV
- 23. Downs SH, Black N (1998) The feasibility of creating a checklist for the assessment of the methodological quality both of randomised and nonrandomised studies of health care interventions. J Epidemiol Community Health 52: 377-384. Link: https://bit.ly/3c1ZISY
- 24. The Joanna Briggs Institute. Joanna Briggs Institute Reviewers' Manual. Edition. 2014.
- Sterne JAC, Newton HJ (2009) Meta- Analysis in Stata: An Updated Collection from the Stata Journal. Stata Press. Link: https://bit.ly/3c1k3b9
- Barendregt JJ, Doi SA, Lee YY, Norman RE, Vos T (2013) Meta-analysis of prevalence. J Epidemiol Community Health 67: 974-978. Link: https://bit.ly/2xsoKM3
- Thompson SGS, Sharp SJ (1999) Explaining heterogeneity in meta-analysis: a comparison of methods. Stat Med 18: 2693-2708. Link: https://bit.ly/2YqWc0E
- Cochran WG (1950) The comparison of percentages in matched samples. Biometrika 37: 256-266. Link: https://bit.ly/2z8EjsE
- 29. Egger M, Smith GD, Schneider M, Minder C (1997) Bias in metaanalysis detected by a simple, graphical test. BMJ 315: 629-634. Link: https://bit.ly/2WexRbu
- Adjei A, Lartey M, Adiku TK, Rodrigues O, Renner L, et al. (2013) Cryptosporidium oocysts in Ghanaian AIDS patients with diarrhoea. Plos One 8: e57914.
- Fisseha B, Petros B, WoldeMichael T (1998) Cryptosporidium and other parasites in Ethiopian AIDS patients with chronic diarrhoea. East Afr Med J 75: 100-101. Link: https://bit.ly/35uUzRc
- Akinbo OF, Okaka CE, Omoregie R (2010) Prevalence of intestinal parasitic infections among HIV patients in Benin City, Nigeria. Libyan J Med 5. Link: https://bit.ly/2W0KFnf
- 33. Nkenfou CN, Nana CT, Payne VK (2013) Intestinal Parasitic Infections in HIV Infected and Non-Infected Patients in a Low HIV Prevalence Region, West-Cameroon. Plos One 8: e57914.Link: https://bit.ly/3fcTAJN

011

- 34. Gedle D, Kumera G, Eshete T, Ketema K, Adugna H, et al. (2017) Intestinal parasitic infections and its association with undernutrition and CD4 T cell levels among HIV/AIDS patients on HAART in Butajira, Ethiopia. J Health Popul Nutr 36: 15.Link: https://bit.ly/35oN9i6
- 35. Nsagha DS, Njunda AL, Assob NJC, Ayima CW, Tanue EA, et al. (2016) Intestinal parasitic infections in relation to CD4+ T cell counts and diarrhea in HIV/AIDS patients with or without antiretroviral therapy in Cameroon. BMC Infectious Diseases 16. Link: https://bit.ly/2KTN4cP
- 36. Houpt ER, Bushen OY, Sam NE, Kohli A, Asgharpour A, et al. (2005) Short report: asymptomatic Cryptosporidium hominis infection among human immunodeficiency virus-infected patients in Tanzania. Am J Trop Med Hyg 73: 520-522. Link: https://bit.ly/3fiiNCK
- Hunter G, Bagshawe AF, Baboo KS, Luke R, Prociv P (1992) Intestinal parasites in Zambian patients with AIDS. Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg 86: 543-545. Link: https://bit.ly/2zNtLQ8
- 38. Kiros H Nibret E, Munshea A, Kerisew B, Adal M (2015) Prevalence of intestinal protozoan infections among individuals living with HIV/AIDS at Felegehiwot Referral Hospital, Bahir Dar, Ethiopia. Int J Infect Dis 35: 80-86. Link: https://bit.ly/3f7cL7E
- Adamu H, Wegayehu T, Petros B (2013) High Prevalence of Diarrhoegenic Intestinal Parasite Infections among Non-ART HIV Patients in Fitche Hospital, Ethiopia. PLoS One 8: e72634. Link: https://bit.ly/3b2KBr3
- Wanyiri JW, Kanyi H, Maina S, Wang DE, Steen A, et al. (2014) Cryptosporidiosis in HIV/AIDS Patients in Kenya: Clinical Features, Epidemiology, Molecular Characterization and Antibody Responses. Am J Trop Med Hyg 91: 319-328. Link: https://bit.ly/3fdNCbo
- 41. Nakibirango J, Mugenyi V, Nsaba D, Nsimemukama A, Rugera SP (2019) Prevalence of cryptosporidiosis and hygiene practices among HIV/AIDS patients in southwest Uganda. HIV/AIDS 11: 141-145. Link: https://bit.ly/3dbgFEa

- 42. Lehman LG, Kangam L, Mbenoun ML, Zemo Nguepi E, Essomba N, et al. (2013) Intestinal parasitic and candida infection associated with HIV infection in Cameroon. J Infect Dev Ctries 7: 137-143. Link: https://bit.ly/35xUrAo
- Lebbad M, Norrgren H, Nauclér A, Dias F, Andersson S, et al. (2001) Intestinal parasites in HIV-2 associated AIDS cases with chronic diarrhoea in Guinea-Bissau. Acta Tropica 80: 45-49. Link: https://bit.ly/2Ssk9Ry
- Marie-Esther DU, Vincent E, Ilemobayo L, Akunnaya U (2013) Intestinal parasitic infestations among people living with HIV/AIDS in Nsukka, Southeast Nigeria.
  Int J Curr Microbiol 2: 539-550. Link: https://bit.ly/2z75Vyl
- 45. Girma M, Teshome W, Petros B, Endeshaw T (2014) Cryptosporidiosis and Isosporiasis among HIV-positive individuals in south Ethiopia: A cross sectional study. BMC Infectious Diseases 14. Link: https://bit.ly/2SwZDyW
- 46. Zinyowera SM, Ruhanya V, Midzi N, Berejena C, Chin'ombe N, et al. (2014) Human parasitic protozoa in drinking water sources in rural Zimbabwe and their link to HIV infection. Germs 4: 87. Link: https://bit.ly/35p3inM
- 47. Teklemariam Z, Abate D, Mitiku H, Dessie Y (2013) Prevalence of Intestinal Parasitic Infection among HIV Positive Persons Who Are Naive and on Antiretroviral Treatment in Hiwot Fana Specialized University Hospital, Eastern Ethiopia. ISRN AIDS 2013: 324329. Link: https://bit.ly/2WkltqG
- Vouking MZ, Enoka P, Tamo CV, Tadenfok CN, et al. (2014) Prevalence of intestinal parasites among HIV patients at the Yaoundé Central Hospital, Cameroon. Pan Afr Med J 18: 136. Link: https://bit.ly/2Wklif0
- Casmo V, Lebbad M, Maungate S, Lindh J (2018) Occurrence of Cryptosporidium spp. and Cystoisospora belli among adult patients with diarrhoea in Maputo, Mozambique. Heliyon 4: e00769. Link: https://bit.ly/2KXYIsw
- Adjei A, Lartey M, Adiku TK, Rodrigues O, Renner L et al. (2003) Cryptosporidium Oocysts In Ghanaian Aids Patients With Diarrhoea. East Afr Med J 80: 369-372. Link: https://bit.ly/3c07Vaq

#### Discover a bigger Impact and Visibility of your article publication with Peertechz Publications

#### Highlights

- Signatory publisher of ORCID
- Signatory Publisher of DORA (San Francisco Declaration on Research Assessment)
  - Articles archived in worlds' renowned service providers such as Portico, CNKI, AGRIS, TDNet, Base (Bielefeld University Library), CrossRef, Scilit, J-Gate etc.
- Journals indexed in ICMJE, SHERPA/ROMEO, Google Scholar etc
- OAI-PMH (Open Archives Initiative Protocol for Metadata Harvesting)
- Dedicated Editorial Board for every journal
- Accurate and rapid peer-review process
- Increased citations of published articles through promotions
- Reduced timeline for article publication

Submit your articles and experience a new surge in publication services

(https://www.peertechz.com/submission).

Peertechz journals wishes everlasting success in your every endeavours.

Copyright: © 2020 Awulachew E, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

012